Non-governmental organizations (NGOs) working with social welfare in China

Characteristics, difficulties, possibilities

Beiliu Li
Ying Wang

2011

Examensarbete, Kandidatnivå, 15 hp
Socialt arbete
Social Work, Specialisation in International Social Work

Handledare: Nader Ahmadi
Examinator: Sam Larsson
Abstract

NGOs working with social welfare in China
Characteristics, difficulties, possibilities

Beiliu Li, Ying Wang

Non-governmental Organizations play an increasingly important role in society today. The purpose of this study was to investigate the characteristics, difficulties, and possibilities for NGOs working with social welfare in China. This paper presents data by using qualitative method and analyzes it with the social ecological perspective. The results of this study show that top-down NGOs like the one studied in this paper are experimental organizations which are established according to China’s social environment in order to undertake the welfare services ordered by the government. In this way the government legalizes the working of NGOs. However, the result is that, on the one hand, NGOs help government to promote the quality of public services, and on the other, relying on the government becomes an obstruction of NGOs development.

Keywords: Non-Governmental Organization, Community Public Centre, Government Organized NGO, Purchase of Service Contracting.
Foreword

Special thanks to:

All the respondents that participated in the study
Nader Ahmadi
Julian Ilicki
Yu Xu
Johan Kejerfors
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. INTRODUCTION ...................................................................................................................................................... 1

2. AIM .............................................................................................................................................................................. 1

3. RESEARCH QUESTION ............................................................................................................................................... 1

4. CENTRAL CONCEPTS AND DEFINITIONS .................................................................................................................. 1
   4.1 THE DEFINITION OF NGO ....................................................................................................................................... 1
   4.2 THE TYPES OF NGOS IN CHINA .......................................................................................................................... 2

5. BACKGROUND ............................................................................................................................................................ 4
   5.1 NGO’S DEVELOPMENT IN CHINA ......................................................................................................................... 4
   5.2 CHUNXI ROAD COMMUNITY PUBLIC CENTRE (CPC) ....................................................................................... 4
   5.3 THE CHANGE IN THE MENTALITY OF CHINA’S GOVERNMENT TO NGO ......................................................... 5

6. EARLIER RESEARCH .................................................................................................................................................... 7
   6.1 THE RELATIONSHIPS BETWEEN NGOS AND STATES ........................................................................................ 7
   6.2 GOVERNANCE AND MANAGEMENT ISSUES OF NGOS .................................................................................. 7
   6.3 MANAGEMENT WITHIN THE NGO ..................................................................................................................... 8
   6.4 WELFARE POLICY IN CHINA ............................................................................................................................... 8
   6.5 ECONOMIC ............................................................................................................................................................ 9

7. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK ...................................................................................................................................... 10
   7.1 THEORETICAL PERSPECTIVE ............................................................................................................................. 10
   7.2 ANALYTICAL MODEL .............................................................................................................................................. 12

8. METHODOLOGY .......................................................................................................................................................... 14
   8.1 CONTRIBUTION TO SOCIAL WORK AND TO SOCIETY ...................................................................................... 14
   8.2 DATA COLLECTION .................................................................................................................................................. 14
   8.3 SELECTION OF LITERATURE ............................................................................................................................... 15
   8.4 ETHICAL CONSIDERATION ................................................................................................................................ 15
       8.4.1 Informed consent .............................................................................................................................................. 15
       8.4.2 Confidentiality ............................................................................................................................................. 15
       8.4.3 Consequence and the role of researcher ..................................................................................................... 16
   8.5 PHILOSOPHY OF SCIENCE ................................................................................................................................ 16
   8.6 TRANSCRIPTION ..................................................................................................................................................... 16
   8.7 ANALYSIS .............................................................................................................................................................. 17
       8.7.1 Content analysis .............................................................................................................................................. 17
       8.7.2 Theoretical analysis ................................................................................................................................... 17
   8.8 RELIABILITY .......................................................................................................................................................... 17
9. RESULTS AND ANALYSIS

9.1 MICRO-SELF CONTROL LEVEL
9.1.1 Characteristics
9.1.2 Difficulties
9.1.3 Possibilities

9.2 MESO-INFLUENCE LEVEL
9.2.1 Characteristics
9.2.2 Possibilities
9.2.3 Difficulties

9.3 MACRO-FRAMEWORK
9.3.1 Characteristics
9.3.2 Difficulties

9.4 HOW ARE NGOS DEFINED IN CHINA

10. DISCUSSION

10.1 BRIEF SUMMARY OF THE RESULTS
10.2 THEORY DISCUSSION
10.3 METHODOLOGY DISCUSSION
10.4 COMPARISONS TO WESTERN COUNTRIES
10.4.1 Development level
10.4.2 Financial sources
10.4.3 Social impacts
10.5 CONNECT TO SOCIAL WELFARE
10.6 FURTHER STUDY

11. REFERENCES

12. APPENDIX 1-INTERVIEW GUIDE 1
13. APPENDIX 2-INTERVIEW GUIDE 2
1. Introduction

China is in a social transitional period. Non-Governmental Organizations (NGOs) as a significant force give an impetus to the vicissitude of China's social structure. The development of NGOs has attracted society's attention.

Professional social work is a new type of occupation in China. According to the Chinese association of social workers' report, there are more than 200 universities that have a social work program - over 10,000 graduates every year - but only 10 - 30% of them choose to do social work (Li, 2008). NGOs in China provide job opportunities for those graduates to do professional social work. This research is connected with what we are studying and we can use our professional knowledge to have a deeper understanding about NGO's work in China.

In earlier research, we noticed that researchers doing their studies unilaterally. For instance, Clark (1998) writes about the politics of NGOs in South-East Asia, and Huang (2001) talks about NGOs developing trends in China. Jia (2003) discusses the current situation of China's NGOs. This research will analyze NGO's working characteristics, difficulties and possibilities from the micro, meso and macro level to see how China's society provides challenges and possibilities for NGOs.

2. Aim

The aim of this research is to analyze new development models of NGOs working with social welfare under the social situation of China from micro, meso, and macro level.

3. Research questions

What are the characteristics, difficulties and possibilities for NGOs working with social welfare in China?

4. Central concepts and definitions

4.1 The definition of Non-governmental organization (NGO)

In one of the first rigorous studies of the NGO sector, Salamon and Anheier (1999) use a seven-fold test to distinguish NGOs from a variety of other organizational forms. NGOs, they argue, are: formal; private; non-profit-distributing; self-governing; voluntary; non-religious; non-political (Clark, 1998).
The World Bank defines NGOs as private organizations that pursue activities to relieve suffering, promote the interests of the poor, protect the environment, provide basic social services, or undertake community development (World Bank, 2001). United Nations (2003) describes an NGO as any non-profit, voluntary citizens' group which is organized on a local, national or international level. Task-orientated and driven by people with a common interest, NGOs perform a variety of services and humanitarian functions, bring citizens' concerns to Governments, monitor policies and encourage political participation at the community level (Lewis, 2000). They provide analysis and expertise, serve as early warning mechanisms, and help monitor and implement international agreements. Some are organized around specific issues, such as human rights, the environment or health.

NGOs take different forms and play different roles in different continents. Although there is some disagreement about the definition of an NGO, it is widely accepted that these are organizations which pursue activities to relieve suffering, promote interests of the poor, protect the environment, provide basic social services, and undertake community development (Cleary, 1997). According to Turner and Hulme: “NGOs are generally registered organizations, community groups, professional associations, trade unions, cooperate charity organizations whose aim is to improve the well being of their members and of those areas in which they exists” (Turner & Hulme, 1997: 200).

Additionally, NGOs should be independent from the government and non-profit. NGOs should not be considered a political party with an aim of attaining political power and an NGO should support development which demonstrates its public interest character (Schiaampo-Campo & Sundaram, 2001).

4.2 The types of NGOs in China

NGOs are classified into two types in China. The first is the "Bottom - up" NGO, which is defined as an NGO that the citizens themselves organized without financial support from the government. This kind of NGO is influenced by government policy, the needs of the people, and how they can get support.

The other type is the "Top - down" NGO. This kind of NGO is supported by the government but has its own system and employees. This type of NGO may be asked by the government to fulfill certain objectives. Due to China’s political situation, the government is faced with many problems. As a consequence, the "Top - down" NGO is tasked with helping the government deal with social pressures. The NGO can take
over some of the government’s responsibilities and work in cooperation with the community.

The concept of NGO came into use in 1945 following the establishment of the United Nations Organizations which recognized the need to give a consultative role to organizations which were not classified as neither government nor member states (Willett, 2002). Top-down NGO is theoretically independent from the government, but it is more connected with government than the bottom-up NGO. In this research, the authors will use Chunxi Road Community Public Centre (CPC) as a typical top-down NGO to analyze and discuss if this kind of NGO in China is a real non-governmental organization or essentially still a part of the government.
5. Background

5.1 NGO's development in China

According to Jia (2003), there have been four stages of NGO development in China since 1949 (the year of the founding of the People's Republic of China). The first stage is initial development, from 1949 to 1966. In this stage, some social groups appeared due to political needs. The groups included the Federation of youth, the Women's Federation, the Federation of Industry and Commerce, and many academic and arts groups.

The second stage is stagnation, from 1966 to 1978. Because of the influence of Cultural Revolution, all of the groups stopped their activities and no new group established.

The third stage is the recovery and development stage, from 1978 to 1995. In order to meet the needs of reform of China, large social groups appeared. These consisted mainly of industrial associations and foundation. By 1989, there were around 1600 national social groups in China which is 16 times that of 1978. Local groups increased to 200,000. This shows that in 1980s, with economic development and a loose social and political environment, social groups developed significantly.

The fourth stage is from 1995 until now. In 1995, the fourth World Conference on Women was held in Beijing which was a symbol that China’s Bottom-up NGOs had become more active. In 1998, China established Management of the Registration of Social Organizations and began to register social groups. This marked the standardization and legalization of social groups.

5.2 Chunxi Road Community Public Centre (CPC)

Chunxi Road Community Public Centre is a typical "Top- down" NGO in China. The authors chose CPC as an example because it illustrates a new concept in China's society – using a top-down NGO to alleviate the government’s burden of delivering services. CPC is an experimental project for the government and it’s the only one in south-western China. It is interesting to observe how this new type of NGO works in China, and what the characteristics, difficulties, and possibilities are for it. Also, one of the authors had her field practice in CPC for 5 months which helped us gather more information and data for this study.

Chunxi Road Community Public Centre (CPC) is in JinJiang Community, Chengdu, China. It's a 400 m² house in the centre of the city. CPC began to operate in 2010 and has two main functions. One is to provide services to residents who live
in JinJiang Community, and the other is to guide and regulate the development of social organizations and evaluate all the social organizations' development in the community.

Because this study is focused on social welfare, the authors pay more attention to the services CPC provides to residents.

There are five rooms provided to citizen who are willing to come to CPC. There is a painting room for citizens to practice painting and writing, a reading room, a computer room providing free computer and internet access, a physical therapy room for senior citizens, and a large dancing room for different activities such as dancing, Tai Ji, and YOGA.

CPC devotes a lot of attention to its senior citizens. It collects all of the information about seniors who are over 80 years old in the community. It not only offers medical help in the centre but it also organizes doctors and social workers to go to the home of seniors every weekend to check their blood pressure or ask if they need any help.

Because this centre is a "Top - down" NGO, the government gives this centre certain support such as locations and facilities, as well as financial support for rent, electricity, water and Internet fees.

There are four main goals of this centre which are to provide social services to residents enhance the quality of life, promote social harmony and stability, and provide a template for community improvement in the future.

5.3 The change in the mentality of China's government to NGOs

The fourth World Conference on Women has been held in Beijing since 1995 and it is since then that the Chinese government has begun to change its stance towards NGOs. According to Tian (2009), there are seven points that show the change:

(1) A government established special research institution to do profound research about NGOs.

(2) Research promoting NGOs led by Zhongshan University which plays an increasingly important role.

(3) Government approval of the idea that NGOs can significantly improve society.

(4) Governmental support for local authorities to give guidance and help to developing NGOs.

(5) Enterprise begins to pay attention to NGOs and give their intention to provide support.
(6) NGOs obtain the right to get government recognition through registration.

(7) Media enhancing the message of NGOs.
6. Earlier research

In this study the authors try to determine the characteristics, difficulties, and possibilities for NOGs working with social welfare in China. In researching this topic, the authors discover that there only a few sources that can answer these NGOs and state, management, policy issues and financials issues. The authors incorporate those parts into this chapter to see how other researchers analyze NGO’s working model from different perspectives. The authors combine those research results with their own analysis to get a new development model of NGOs working with social welfare in China. Although some of the research is based on western experiences, the authors chose to incorporate it because it can serve as an interesting point of comparison.

6.1 The relationship between NGOs and states

With increasing demands on the state by citizens, the state can no longer be the sole provider of goods and services, and NGOs need the state agencies to deliver services to them. NGOs can complement, reform, and oppose the state.

Thomas (1992) argued that the role of the state becomes more of an enabler rather than a provider of services. In their reforming role NGOs are seen as agents of advocacy and contribute immensely to policy dialogue. NGOs are able to represent the interests of the people they work with and in this case can ensure that policies are adaptable to real life situations. Finally, NGOs can oppose the state. They can do this by acting as watchdogs and holding the state accountable. This can be achieved through several methods including lobbying or even overtly supporting groups which are adversely affected by the policies of the government (Thomas, 1992).

6.2 Governance and management issues of NGOs

In many developing countries NGOs often lack the institutional capacity and resources to operate and funds from donors are sometimes poorly managed. Staff at the local level may not be familiar with government policies and this affects efficiency of the NGOs because of tensions which may arise. It is very important to have good governance and effective management in every NGO. There are number of ways that to improve NGO's governance and management operations. These include stating their mission, values, and objectives clearly, and ensuring that these strategies are followed. Additionally, having better human resources development and training for managers and staff (including board members and volunteers) is
very important. Better management processes as well as financial management, accounting, and budget systems are also required (Lekorwe & Mpabanga, 2007).

In China, the competition between non-governmental organizations has been opposed by Chinese government. The government always incorporates with some NGOs which have some or similar purpose and scope of services. The application that these NGOs want to constitute cannot be ratified. The government wants to control the number of NGO that will be easy to manage. The disadvantages outweigh the advantages by doing this, because it facilitates monopoly organization with the purpose of making profits. The competition between NGOs is necessary to ensure that NGOs will develop in a sustained, rapid, and sound way. The competition will help NGOs improve themselves, advance the quality of services, stimulate creativity to extend services (Liao, 2010).

6.3 Management within the NGO

We got the idea from Lewis (2000) about how the management in the NGO is and what kinds of stuff should be considered. Najam (1999) said that we can see NGOs as ‘policy entrepreneurs’ and sets out three stage of the ‘policy process’, which is the process of conceiving, designing, and implementing public action. These processes can be broken down into agenda setting, policy development and policy implementation. Within the policy process, Najam suggests that there are four types of NGO roles: Service providers (acting directly to do what needs to be done), advocates (prodding government to do the right thing), innovators (suggesting and showing how things could be done differently), and finally monitors (trying to ensure that government and business do what they are supposed to be doing). All of these roles require NGOs to have strong management skills for a long-term development. In order to be successful, the service delivery and advocacy roles each require NGOs to develop appropriate structures which ‘get the work done’ as well as conforming to the NGOs’ own values and priorities. It could also be a challenge for NGOs to combine service delivery, policy advocacy and innovation.

6.4 Welfare policy in China

October 1950, the Government Administrative Council announced the Labor Insurance Regulations (LIR) that covered benefits for sick and disabled workers, as well as retirement benefits. Before the 1980s, the Chinese state bore the financial burden of the social security system. Since then, the state, the work units, and the employees share
the expenses for social security. By the late 1980s, approximately 80 percent of all
townships and counties across China implemented pooled pension funds. Beginning in
the early 1990s, China began to reform its pension system by centralizing the managerial
power of retirement schemes from enterprise level to local government level. Beginning
in 1995, the Chinese pension system adopted two-tier systems: a defined benefit system
financed by pay-as-you-go taxes and a system that relies on contributions of both
employers and employees in state-owned enterprises (Feldstein, 1998).

The Chinese welfare state was and still is characterized by a great dualism of realized
welfare rights of people living in the cities, who profit from various welfare state
programs, and that of those living in the countryside, which cannot rely on state welfare.
70 to 80 percent of China's population resides in the countryside. However, the welfare
state was especially designed for the workers and employees in the cities who might
have represented an acute danger for the Communist regime in times of social
discontent. State intervention that was aimed to improve the welfare of city dwellers
helped to sustain the legitimacy of the state and the power of enterprise over the work
force (Wong & Mok, 1995).

The major task for future social policy in China is: (1) to incorporate those who are not
covered by social security, that is, farmers and their dependants, as well as workers and
entrepreneurs in the booming small and medium-sized enterprises; and (2) to continue
unifying social security schemes all across China (Aspalter, 2001).

6.5 Economic

Economic support always plays an important role to NGO’s development. As Liao
(2010) mentioned, China, in comparison to more developed countries, has really just
started financially supporting NGOs. Ultimately, the goal of most NGOs is to benefit
the public but due to a lack of financial support, they are limited in this regard.
Because of this, some of the NGOs make a profit on the commercial activities. Their
neglect can harm the interests of the public welfare and social benefits. The character
of these organizations has been changed in some ways.
7. Theoretical framework

NGOs in China are not only primary level (micro level) organizations that provide social services, but are also involved at other levels. That means if the NGOs intend to have a stable development under Chinese social structure, they cannot confine their activities and resources to the community where they operate. The objectives and the resources of NGOs also include the factors outside the communities, such as the cooperation between organizations, the relation with the media, and the relevant national policies. Therefore, the research on the new development models for the Chinese NGOs working with welfare cannot be analyzed just at micro level. Since the interaction between each level is a complicated and dynamic process it is preferred to use ecological perspective for interpretation and analysis of this process. The core of the ecological perspective is the connection of continuous interaction between the individuals and their environment (Sands, 2001). However, since NGOs interact with their environments, the process of adaption and modification can also be analyzed through system theory. In this paper, the authors combine system theory with ecological perspective to make a multi-analyze of NGOs’ development in China.

7.1 Theoretical perspectives

Systems theory indicates that it is possible to obtain the same results in several different ways or get different results in similar circumstances because the parts of the system interact in different way. Further, the systems theory emphasizes process, how the social phenomena happen and what is the content and outcomes of this process. According to this theory, three different systems can be identified in the society: informal or natural systems such as family, friends; formal systems like community groups; societal systems like hospitals, schools. All these systems interact with each other. Systems theory provides a way to understand how different elements can influence an individual or group, and offers a context for such understanding including showing how the public and private interact, how various change agent might be involved, and how workers and their agencies might themselves be targets for change (Payne, 2005). In order to get more clear way to analyze the data that we have collected, the authors combine system theory with social ecological perspectives.

The most conventional definition of the "ecological perspective" implies "the interdisciplinary scientific study of the living conditions of organisms in interaction..."
with each other and with the surroundings, organic as well as inorganic” (Naess 1989, p. 36). When ecological perspective is applied to the social work discipline, it is expanded to explain that an individual is "constantly creating, restructuring, and adapting to the environment as the environment is affecting them" (Ungar, 2002). However, the system theory has the similarity with the ecological approach. But they have differences that the system theory breaks down the term “environment” into several levels with power and influence. Therefore, ecological perspective provides a comprehensive, dynamic, interactive point of view to social work practice. By using the ecological perspective, the interaction between each level, the adaptability between individual and environment etc could be understood (Bronfenbrenner, 1979).

Bronfenbrenner’s Ecological Model of Human Development examines how different elements affect each other in a social environment. Bronfenbrenner’s ecological model argues that “in order to understand human development, one must consider that entire ecological system in which growth occurs” (Bronfenbrenner, 1994, p.38). In this theory, Bronfenbrenner divided the system into five sub-systems which are:

Microsystems are domains “within the immediate environment of which proximal processes operate to produce and sustain development” (Bronfenbrenner, 1994, p. 39). They include settings in which the individual lives.

Mesosystems comprise the relations between Microsystems or connection between two or more settings (Ibid, p.40).

Exosystems refer to the relations between two or more settings. Unlike mesosystems, exosystems require that at least one system is not directly related to the developing person (Ibid, p.40).

Macrosystems are overarching patterns of the three systems we mentioned above, focusing on the given culture in which individuals live (Ibid, p.40).

Chronosystems are focused on the environmental circumstances in which a person lives. According to these systems, when time changes, the individuals may react differently to environmental changes and may be more able to determine how that change will influence them (Ibid, p.40).

In this study, the authors choose to use Microsystems, mesosystems and macrosystems to analyze the data. The reason why only three systems are chosen is that in social ecological perspectives both mesosystems and exosystems refer to the interactional processes between multiple Microsystems. The difference is that
exosystems require at least one system shall not directly contain the individual. In our research, the authors focus on all the direct factors related to individual like how NGOs cooperate with other organizations, the relationship with residents in the community and so on, that is all elements belonging to mesosystems. Chornosystems emphasize with the time changes, individual may react differently to the environment, but in this study, CPC is a new institution for residents, so this system is not be considered in this research.

Bronfenbrenner mentioned that this ecological model can also been used as a framework for illustrating representative research findings (Ibid, p.37). By using Bronfenbrenner’s thought of ecological model to combine with system theory, we can say informal or natural systems, formal systems and societal systems also can be seen as Microsystems, Mesosystems and Macrosystems. So the authors decide to use these three systems and developed an analytical model in the following chapter.

7.2 Analytical model

![Analytical model based on Bronfenbrenner’s ecological model](image)

Figure 1: Analytical model based on Bronfenbrenner’s ecological model

Based on Bronfenbrenner’s ecological model, the authors choose to use an analytical model (Figure 1) to help readers to understand the function of each level
more intuitively. Each circle is nested within the others and has different ranges of influence. The authors’ note that, NGOs can not only be influenced by the community (meso level) but also is affected by the broad environment of China (macro level). At the micro level, we see CPC as a unit or an individual - its objective, service content, and budget constitute its management system. These are aspects that control the development of CPC. The meso level focuses on the influence from community, how CPC works with other NGOs, and how it cooperates with other organizations in its community. At the macro level we try to figure out what economic system, political system and social environment give a framework to NGOs. We try to analyze NGOs like CPC's characteristics, difficulties and possibilities in different levels, and get a comprehensive understanding about NGOs working with social welfare.
8. Methodology

The objective of this study is to analyze the new development models of NGOs working with social welfare in China. The authors chose to use the qualitative method which included interviews and a literature study.

8.1 Contribution to social work and to society

The International Federation of Social Workers (IFSW) comments that social work should be:

"Dedicated to service for the welfare and self-fulfillment of human beings; to the development and disciplined use of scientific knowledge regarding human behavior and society; to the development of resources to meet individual, group, national and international needs and aspirations; to the enhancement and improvement of the quality of life of people; and to the achievement of social justice" (IFSW, 2000).

Using CPC as a typical model of top-down NGO to analysis may help the society gets more understanding about NGO working with social welfare in China. By analyzing CPC's characteristics, difficulties, and possibilities, people can develop a deeper understanding about top-down NGOs, and it may serve as a reference to improve the community welfare situation in China.

8.2 Data collection

Basically, we have gathered information about the general situation of the NGOs in China through literature study. Information about CPC’s specific situation and the way the government runs purchase of services, contracting etc. have been gathered through interviews.

Interview A was carried out as a face to face interview with the chief of the CPC. This interview was made by one of the authors during her field practice at CPC about one year ago. The interview was a semi-structured one based on the interview guide 1 (see appendix 1). The interview took about one hour. The purpose of this interview was to collect a general information about CPC. In this regard the interviewer asked few open questions and let the interviewee reflect more around those questions. Mostly, the results of this interview are used as the background of this study.
Interview B was carried out with the same person, i.e. the chief of CPC, but on another occasion. One of the reasons why we decided to interview the same person twice was to check if the respondents’ answers were the same, and also to ask more specific questions related to this research.

Interview C was carried out with a social worker who worked in CPC full time. Interview D was carried out with the deputy director of the Department of Civil Affairs in Jinjiang Community (where CPC operates) in Chengdu province.

Interview E was carried out with the director of Jinjiang Community’s sub-district office.

Interview F was carried out with the deputy director of Jinjiang Community’s sub-district office.

Interviews B, C, D, E, F were telephone interviews via Skype, around 30~40 minutes each, and were recorded. These five interviews were fully structured interviews including more specific questions related to our research question and the aim of this study.

8.3 Selection of literature

Because this study is about China's NGOs and the authors are in Sweden, telephone interviews and former practice experiences are not enough, so the authors conducted a large number of literature studies. First, a number of relevant articles were found in the university's online databases by using the key words NGO in China, social welfare, NGO's management. Second, the China association of social worker's report helped the authors find more articles about specific information concerning NGOs in China. Also, during the interviews the authors noticed that there are some relevant rules and regulations which interviewees mentioned. The authors checked those regulations and included them as a part of the literature study.

8.4 Ethical Consideration

Ethical issues go through the entire process of an interview investigation, especially in qualitative research. There are four of the fields that are traditionally discussed in ethical guidelines for researchers: informed consent, confidentiality, consequences, and the role of the researcher (Kvale & Brinkmann, 2009). Authors use this as ethical guidelines when doing those interviews.

8.4.1 Informed Consent
Before interview the respondents were given brief information about this study. What is the overall purpose of this study and what kind of question may be ask in interview and the interview is voluntary participate and they can stop the interview at anytime. Respondents have been informed that during the interview author will use audio recorder in order to do transcription later (Ibid.).

8.4.2 Confidentiality

Respondents have been informed that the research is anonymous. Before the interview begins, the authors make it clear that they will not refer to the names of respondents, only describe their position at CPC. Coded language is used when analyzing their interview (Ibid).

8.4.3 Consequences and the role of the researcher

Respondents get the information that this research will be published on the university website in Sweden and the purpose of this study is only for academic exchange. The authors are also aware of the researcher’s integrity, that “his or her knowledge, experience, honesty, and fairness is the decisive factor” (Kvale & Brinkmann, 2009, p.74). When doing research, researchers should be familiar with ethical guidelines and ethical issues they may face.

8.5 Philosophy of science

In this study, the authors chose to use hermeneutics as a philosophy guide when analyzing interview data. Hermeneutics focus on the facts and reality which respondents represent in their data (Patton, 2002). The purpose of interview is to get detail information about how CPC operate; we try to use hermeneutics to interpret the transcription and get a common understanding of the meaning and put the text into China's economic, political, social background. Different authors may have different interpretation when they analysis the same data, in this study, two authors choose to interpret the transcription separately, and then check if they get the same conclusion. In parts where the authors are not in agreement, we chose to call the respondents again to avoid misunderstanding.

8.6 Transcription

All interviews were transcribed by the authors themselves. "Researchers who transcribe their own interviews will learn much about their own interviewing style; to some extent they will have the social and emotional aspects of the interview situation present or reawakened during transcription, and will already have started
the analysis of the meaning of what was said” (Kvale & Brinkmann, 2009, p.178). The authors use audio recording when doing face to face and telephone interviews. The total interview conversation is written down later. All transcriptions are Chinese and have been analyzed in Chinese in order to understand respondents as literally as possible. The transcription has been analyzed by the authors separately to check if the authors get the same results and conclusion.

8.7 Analysis

8.7.1 Content analysis

Patton (2002) describes content analysis as having the following five steps: identifying, coding, categorizing, classifying, and labeling. The authors also use these five steps to analyze the interview transcriptions. The transcription was been read several times. The first thing to do was to identify and code the information that we found to be relevant to this study. After this step we categorized the data into three parts: the characteristics, possibilities and difficulties. We tried to sort and to interpret the interviewees information under these categories and to take away the unnecessary information in regard to this study. The third step was classifying and labeling the three types of sources into three levels based on social ecological perspectives, that is the micro, meso, and macro systems.

8.7.2 Theoretical analysis

Ecological system perspective is the theoretical basis of this research. It could be used to analyze the collected data in a comprehensive way. In order to achieve the objective of this study, NGOs were defined as the basic unit – the micro system. Ecological system is a holistic form which consists of different sub-systems. These sub-systems have different levels and interact with each other. As mentioned before, and due to the situation of the NGOs in China, this research will not merely focus on the micro level but also pay attention to the circumstances on other levels and study how they influence the micro level, as well.

The authors take CPC as an example of individualized study of NGOs to figure out the characteristics, difficulties, and possibilities for NGOs working with social welfare in China through analyzing data at different levels. As an application of the ecological system perspective to this study we can maintain that microsystem contains the unit’s (here the NGO,s) self-management; mesosystem contains how the unit cooperates with other organizations and how the relationship with the
residents of community are; and macrosystem contains elements such as political and economic patterns but also social conditions which influence the unit’s function.

### 8.8 Reliability

Kvale & Brinkmann (2009) notes that asking the same question several times or in different interviews can check if the respondents' answer was the same. Since the authors had interviewed at CPC before, the former transcription was used when doing analysis. In this way, researchers can compare the former interview with the new interview to check the respondents' answer. As the authors are doing all of the interviews, transcriptions, analysis by themselves, this can be seen as an advantage. The interview guide was carefully worked out in order to reach the objective of the study. In transcribing stage, because the interview is using authors’ mother tongue, so it will be easier to transcribe the interviewee's saying into written language and understand words correctly.

The limitation of this study in terms of reliability is the language. All the transcripts were translated from Chinese to English, and in this process, some of the words or sentences may not be translated exactly. In order to avoid this, two authors try to double check the transcription.

### 8.9 Validity

In this study, the authors use system theory and ecological perspective to design the aim and research question. These are also considered in method part.

After conducting the interview, the authors made a brief summary for the interviewee to make sure the authors interpreted the interviewee correctly (Patton, 2002). By including quotations in the analysis, the validity of the results can be raised. Additionally, when choosing literature the authors verified that the selected literature is pertinent to the research question and aim of the study.

When doing analysis for the transcription, the researchers decided to use investigator triangulation, analyze all the data independently, and then check together if they get the same conclusion. In the end, the researchers check all the data they got again to make sure all the findings have been reported in this report.
9. Results and Analysis

The research question for this study can be stated as follows - what are the characteristics, difficulties, and possibilities for NGOs working with social welfare in China? In order to answer this question, the authors chose CPC as an example of a Chinese NGO. People who work there were interviewed to get a common understanding about CPC and analyze it. According to our analytical model, in order to get a comprehensive understanding about NGOs working with social welfare in China, we decided to divide the results and analysis section into three parts, which are micro (self control) level; meso (influence) level; and macro (framework) level. And in each level, authors summarize the characteristics, difficulties and possibilities of CPC and other NGOs in China, and try to develop a common model for NGO working with community social welfare.

After getting the understanding about NGOs working in China, the authors provide a discussion about how to define NGOs in China - is CPC really a Non-Governmental organization?

9.1 Micro-self control level

In this level, the authors try to analyze the data in the micro (self control) perspective, analyze its objective, service content, and management system to answer the research question.

NGOs like CPC were established as an experimental programme in a particular situation in China. This kind of NGOs’ handle ability and easiness to control made the Chinese government willing to develop this kind of organization. CPC is a supplementary form for the Sub-District office to provide social welfare services. Its scale of services is small and scope of activities is limited. Government financial support is the only source of CPC’s (and NGOs like CPC) income. The difficulty CPC meet is it lack of thorough finance system to ensure use expenses effectively and reasonably; lack of professional social work and knowledge make the innovation ability in certain degree is restricted. The possibilities for CPC is it became a bridge between government and citizens; and for CPC, there are two development direction, one is became an attached organization to government, the other is became more autonomic.
9.1.1 Characteristics

Based on community development theory, China will begin to pay attention to the development of NGOs as it continues to develop economically. These social trends provide good condition to NGO working in the community. The community NGO develops in a unique fashion due to the characteristics of Chinese society.

D: Some of the NGOs were established because the government wanted to provide more services and to develop a better welfare state. However, restricted by the lack of the resources and the knowledge and experiences in this area, the government cannot bear these services. Therefore, such functions and services were transferred to some NGOs.

D explains here the origin and the context of a new type of NGO. This definition of the new type of NGO was not only emphasized by D, but also F gives us a similar interpretation of this type of NGOs and introduces the concept of this context.

F: This type of NGOs can be regarded as a kind of by-product under the purchase of service contracting. When purchasing service contracting the government even transfers the public services, which previously belonged to it, to the NGOs by means of allocating appropriate funds and through public bidding. The financial support that the NGOs get from the government depends on the quality and quantity of the services that the NGOs provide.

The interpretation of the purchase of service contracting provides an overall picture of the situation of the new type NGOs’. On the one hand, there are rather good opportunities for the development of this kind of the NGOs. And on the other, the development of the NGOs relies on and also is restricted by the government resources. However in order to understand how these elements function at the local level, how an NGO is established and works under the situation of purchase of service contracting in the local area etc., we have chosen the Chunxi Road Community Public Centre (CPC) as a specific case to answer these questions. A as the chief of the CPC described almost the same reason for establishing this organization in specific area. CPC was established in a situation where the government wanted a new model for NGOs that would be compatible with future development.
A: Government recognized the blanks of NGO working with welfare in Chengdu, they decide to have an experimental program to see if government service outsourcing will work.

A said that CPC is a government experimental program instead of spontaneous organization. But according to what D and F maintained, this experimental program is not a unique program in China, however it may be the only one in Chengdu province. The experimental program means that if CPC works well the Chinese government may be willing to have more NGOs of this type. We can already observe a tendency that this kind of NGO is actively established by the government with governmental guidance. In other words, one might say that NGOs have high political legitimacy in the China of today.

We ask more details in next interview to the chief about the different function between CPC and government departments, if CPC replaced Sub-District office, the chief explained it:

B: We can not say that the common Sub-District office replaced by our centre. Our CPC is like this, the Sub-District office provides services are limited by labor power. That means they do not have enough employees in Sub-District office to provide enough services for the people who were living in this area. So we establish this CPC to provide the service which they can not do.

Sub-District office is the smallest unit of administrative department of Women’s Federation of government. B's respond of this question shows that CPC is a supplementary form for Sub-District office to provide services.

When we ask more about CPC's scale of services and clients, B responds as follows:

B: We only provide services in our community, we don't have any ability to do something else, because our place is limited, so we only can solve problems in this community, to be honest, it's not enough.

And C talks about the reason why other community’s residents don’t come to CPC:
C: Only residents in our community come here, the other community’s residents do not know about CPC or they won’t come due the distance. We don’t have the ability to go to other communities to provide services.

This indicated that CPC’s scale of services is small and the scope of activities is limited. People only can have activities in a specific place which CPC provides.

When asked about the source of funds and if there are any donations, we got the following answer:

A: The government financial support is the only source of our economic.
B: We do not have any public donations or other public welfare undertaking as western countries.

C is a gross-roots social worker. She doesn’t have the access to the manage level of CPC so she talks about donations through her working experiences:

C: I haven’t heard that CPC gets donations from individuals or companies since I just work here and nobody ask if they can donate money to us.

The financial support from the government is the only source of funds for CPC, which makes CPC like the other government organizations. That is another reason for government to be willing to have this type of NGOs. In this way government funds are still circulating within the government system and in a certain extent. Another reason is that this type of NGO is also easy to control for the government. But A stresses that there are some differences between NGOs like CPC and government organizations. In order to confirm this, the authors use Women’s Federation which belongs to Chinese government organization as an example to compare with:

According to article 35 of All-China Women's Federation Regulation, it said that:

*Chinese government is responsible for the administrative expenses, activities and expansion service funds of Women's Federation. This earmark funds should be add in the all levels of government financial budget. It increases by government financial revenues and expansion services.*
CPC as a representative of NGOs, here is the part that B said is different from government organizations:

*B*: *We can only apply the money from the government once a time each year. At that time, we should give them our activities plan of the year, such as how many activities we want to do in this year, how many people will participate in, how many people we provide service for and what achievement we want to get./…/ we should sign the contract with the government. They will not get the money which we applied for if we can not achieve the purpose of our planning.*

Compared with Women's Federation and CPC's financial support, the government organization's expenditure should be added in to the government financial budget. It has specific regulations to formulate in both government regulations and women’s federation regulations. But the NGOs like CPC did not have that regulation to ensure their regular operation. The financial support from the government for CPC is fixed and the government has specific requirements for CPC. If it cannot achieve these requirements, the financial support could be even less. This support cannot increase through government financial revenues.

When analysis the characteristics of CPC from interview data, researchers use hermeneutics perspective to focus on the fact interviewer mentioned and put those facts author got into China’s social background to see if we can find some deeper meaning or understanding through the interview. Hermeneutics also been used in the next two part to analysis the characteristics of CPC in meso and macro level.

In micro level, A mentioned that CPC is an organization which is not belonging to government. After comparing CPC and Sub-District office’s function, authors get a conclusion that CPC is a supplementary form for Sub-District office to provide community social service to residents; “*We only provide services in our community*” refers that CPC’s scale of services is small and scope of activities is limited, as the only one experimental project in western-south China, CPC didn’t have the ability to help other community or provide services to other residents yet; Government financial support is the only source is another characteristics of CPC, but different from Women’s Federation, it don’t have own regulation to ensure their regular operation.
9.1.2 Difficulties

Money has always been the hardest and biggest question for every organization. So the crux of the matter lies in how to use this money effectively, not how much money the organization can get. CPC also has the same situation. To how to arrange financial budget in CPC, B expressed that:

B: It is hard to say how much money we got from the government. It is not that much... less... But it is enough for our CPC’s operation and employees’ salary. We should have a plan of budget each year. The distribute process is that we should deduct our employees' salary, office equipment wastage and budget of activities such as the payment of teachers and doctors. If there is some money left, it will become the bonus wage for the employees.

Judging from this quote, it is obvious to see that B said they should have a plan of budget at first. But for the budget B only mentioned what kind of money they plan to cost. That is not a planning scheme. B didn't talk anything about their economic system and supervision system of fund expense. C mentioned financial arrangements in more specific way:

C: We always face problems like damaged or missing equipment. At those times I will call worker to come to fix it or go to buy new equipment myself. I need to report to the chief to see if she also thinks it’s necessary to buy a new one, and usually I pay first then give the receipt to chief and get the money back.

Through C’s words, it seems like CPC doesn’t have a budget for equipment failures. They pay when they need it. It shows that CPC lacks a thorough finance system. The implication of this is that it cannot be ensured that the expenses will be used effectively and reasonably.

The NGO’s employees play an important role to NGO. They will determine NGO’s professional level and its development direction. In the following questions, we ask more details about personnel arrangement in CPC and the background of employees.

A: We have three full time employees in CPC: one is retired doctor who come here as half volunteer; two formal workers that responsible for routine work;
four managers, all of them have their own enterprise, they work here as volunteers. The other is part time job, like dancing teacher, painting teacher and so on/.../there is not any professional social worker in this centre, and I think the two employees are doing social work, but they don't have any education about it.

More than half of the people who work in CPC are working part time, and they seldom use volunteers; most of employees are informal workers, it makes hard to ensure the normal operation. Having many informal workers makes management difficult because it is hard to ask them to follow the management’s rules or regulations. With the NGO expand its scale, understaffed may make the problem of NGO's management been more evident than now. In an earlier research, Lekorwe & Mpabange (2007) maintained that better management processes as well as financial management, budget systems and personnel arraignment are required in NGOs development.

In CPC, 57% of the employees are part time and between the ages of 40 to 50 years old. 14% of employees are retired and over 60 years old, and 29% are formal employees between the ages of 20 to 30 years old. This personnel arrangement data indicated that in CPC, the personnel structure and professional knowledge employees have are limited, this will lead the innovation ability in certain degree be restricted. The literature study from Huang (2001) supports our findings. He mentioned that “The challenge from NGO in China itself is lack of professional social workers and good management system, don't have good salary and welfare system to attract young people to participate”.

9.1.3 Possibilities

“NGOs are able to represent the interests of the people they work with” (Thomas, 1992). CPC works with people every day and the people who works there are aware of how locals perceive daily life. This can become a source of information for the government to make policy decisions. The consequence of this is that CPC can take a role in government function and become a bridge between government and the people. In Huang’s (2001) study, he also mentioned the different between NGO and government function for provide welfare services to residents: "Government's project of helping the poor is a broad policy which can't cover some special cases, but NGO usually focus on those special cases and offer help. It covered the shortage of government's policy" (Huang, 2001).
According to Wang (2010), top-down NGOs have two different development directions: One is become an attached organization to government; the other is become more autonomic. CPC's finances are dependent on the government which makes the organization have to arrange activities according to government's plans. If CPC can't change the situation that government support is the only source, it may become an attached organization to government in the future.

9.2 Meso-influence level

In this level, the authors analyze the data from the meso perspective, examine influence from the community, and look at how CPC works with other NGOs in the community. By analyzing CPC, the authors attempt to get a general view of how NGOs deal with social welfare in China. The community welfare services CPC provides to residents are a continuous interactive cooperation process between the state and citizens, government organizations and NGOs, public institutions, and private institution. CPC promotes the quality of public services and improves the function of the community services and it became a part of management force in the community to dissolve some conflicts and contradictions, balance the civic order and state laws, promote community become more diversity and democratization. In the community constructions, NGO gradually transformed to a complementary tool of government management. But the development of NGO especially top-down NGO like CPC are still decided by government policy.

9.2.1 Characteristics

The management of community public affairs which consists of the government, markets, organizations, and residents is a diverse and multi-dimensional process. NGO as a part of managerial subject exist in the community. That requires NGOs to have good connections and cooperation with every aspect of the community.

A: We contact some service agencies to offer free or low-paid services to old people who are over 60 years old, /.../ some supermarkets send the daily groceries to old people's home; Community Service Department provide appliance repair services and so on. /.../ some university students come here to be volunteers
B: The cooperation with government, /.../ is mainly with the department of Sub-District office. We also cooperate with some NGOs. We provide place to them to have activities here. Hospital is also a part of our cooperation, such as district hospital and grassroots clinics. If there is any emergency situation that we can not handle we will connect to the hospital which cooperate with immediately.

In these two interviews, A and B give the authors more specific details about CPC’s cooperation with others, such as which institutions CPC cooperates with and in what form. According to what they say, the purpose of an NGO like CPC is to satisfy people’s needs in the community and to provide community welfare to residents.

When talking about the services CPC provides to residents, C mentioned the reflection from residents who come there:

C: As I can see, more and more people come and willing to come to our CPC ask for help, or just talk to friends /.../

It can be seen that the services CPC provides are a continuous interactive cooperation process between the state and citizens, government organizations and NGOs, public institutions and private institutions. In order to provide better community services to residents and develop this organization itself, it is better to CPC to form a crosscutting and multiple interactive management network system with the characteristic of cooperative relationship and partnership.

The analytical model authors use in this study refers that meso level is focus on the influence from the community, and when talk about community management, it is important to mention the Sub-District office. One of the literature studies from Cui (2008) is talk about the transformation of community management, in China’s society, government is more tends to amplify the function of Sub-District office. The Sub-District office is in the powerful position, because its statutory status and traditional strengths. This indicated that the Sub-District office is still taking a role of ‘government spokesperson’ in each community. It forms a superior-subordinate relationship with other organizations in the community actually. This perception is hard to change in a short period of time.
Theoretically, the state law claims its rationality and legitimacy when human relation conduct regulation has been replaced by state law. But it is hard to be ensured from the subordinate level, it is often necessary to be enforced from the superior level. In fact, the boycott from civic order to state laws and regulations has legitimate motivation of against comprehensively applicable domination. (Cui, 2008)

According to this text, it can be argued that NGOs such as CPC are a part of community management and can dissolve conflicts and contradictions to a certain extent. When talking about the differences between CPC and sub-district office, interviewee E (as an employee within the sub-district office) gave the following picture:

E: CPC works with residents’ everyday problems and is close to them, it provides diversified and personalized public services. All the services they provide have given this organization good reputation in the community. Although sub-district office also provides similar services to the residents, this office is not that close to residents as CPC is.

Interviewee F took up an example to explain the difference between NGO’s and government’s service organizations. He mentioned that the key point of sub-district office for the old people is provide basic needs for them, for instance, the basic living allowances, medical care etc. CPC also provides medical care to old people, but it at the same time, “also provides different activities to them, make old people enjoy their life”.

Closer to the clients and providing a diversity of activities is a conclusion from both E and F’s analysis of the CPC. CPC promotes the quality of public services and has improved the function of community services. Also, CPC is more flexible to offer community welfare services in order to fit for resident’s need. That is also easier for residents to accept it. The reflection of interviewees about CPC is as follow:

B: There is a feeling I never had before is that we provide a place which people can do some activities here. /.../ So the NGOs like CPC become really important to them.
C: As I can see, more and more old people come and willing to come to our CPC ask for help, or just talk to friends. ... they are happy to meet new friends to communicate instead of just stay at home.

People willing to come and talk can propel the civic order and can help policy maker to rationalize the state law. On the other hand, NGOs such as CPC becoming part of community management could balance the civic order and promote diversity and democratization.

The cooperation between the government and NGOs can also be considered in meso-community level.

D: The cooperation model between the government and NGOs in China can normally be categorized into two types: cooperation of the sellers’ model and the cooperative partnership model. As regards the former type, the NGOs are merely the management agent of the government projects. But in the cooperative partnership model, the NGOs have a greater mass of rights in regard to autonomy and decision-making. We normally regard the NGOs such as CPC as the type of cooperation of the sellers’ model.

According to what D said about the category of NGOs in China, CPC is merely a management agent for the government projects; it doesn’t have many rights of autonomy and decision-making. That is quite different from the interpretation of the NGO that is discussed at international level according to which the NGO should be independent from the government and not be a part of any political party with an aim of attaining political power (Schiampo-Campo & Sundaram, 2001). However, the Chinese government definition of the NGOs is, as mentioned before, an organization with extensive cooperation with the government. Nevertheless, D tried to make an additional complement to the previous interpretation of the cooperation model between government and NGOs. D said that “the organizations under the cooperation model are the NGOs that China has, but we normally called the NGOs with Chinese characteristics.” Chinese government regards, in other words, the differences between the status of the NGOs in the country and abroad as the Chinese NGOs’ characteristics, although there is a contradiction between the initial meanings of the term NGO. Because of this government policy the NGOs are working under the cooperation of the sellers’ model (as CPC does) where the status of the
government is that of the dominant part. Therefore, it is hard to claim that the NGOs and the government are two equal subjects in a relationship of collaboration. The same way, in cooperation at the community level, the NGOs like CPC are more close to the position of a subordinate party.

9.2.2 Possibility

In the community construction, NGO gradually transformed to a complementary tool of government management. With the development of community, government cannot meet the increasing demand from residents. As B said:

B: *Because the government realized they can not provide more services to the resident. So the government empowers NGOs to undertake some services. And also China takes example by western countries about the 'small government model'.*

NGOs like CPC provide diverse services in its community, promoting the development of community service functions. They also help the government get rid of specific social services and promote social harmony and stability. Pan & Chen (2007) refers "through policy support, government try to accelerate the development of NGO. This can remedy the deficiency of government's community management." With the maturing of NGO's role about provide public services and governance community, government will diminishing the function of community management,

9.2.3 Difficulties

Sub-District office is the smallest government agencies in China, the basic function of it is providing the basic services to residents, organizing activities and reflect residents' need to the government at the next higher level. One of the reasons to build CPC is some services Sub-District office can't provide to residents. On the one hand, government can choose to empower top-down NGO to provide social services in the community, on the other hand, government also can choose to develop Sub-District office, give it more power or resources. This shows that the development of society and the development of top-down NGO like CPC are decided by government policy.

9.3 Macro-framework
At this level, the authors try to find out how economic, political, and social environment of China creates a framework for the NGOs working with social welfare in the country.

The main conclusion from our data is that NGOs role is to help the government to improve its ability to provide public services to the residents. This top-down structure in the districts becomes then a hinder for the development of the NGOs as independent citizen organizations. The analysis of our interview data shows that a major difficulty in the way for the NGOs is that there is no specific law to protect or support NGOs development. As a consequence, the services that the NGOs provide become limited and they cannot meet the demands of the society in a professional way. Another difficulty that we discovered while analyzing the Chinese regulations for the NGOs was that if an NGO intends to be registered, it needs to go through a very bureaucratic and complicated political process. Even after registration, it needs to subordinate not only the management of the Sub-District office, but also the Civil Affairs Bureau.

Further, the data shows that NGOs in China lack a professional management and an overall plan. Another general shortcoming of the NGOs is that the social workers working there are not familiar with the rules and regulations for their work.

9.3.1 Characteristics:

As a product of purchase of service contracting, the top-down NGOs have been promoting social development in China to a certain extent. During the interviews, both C and E pointed out the implications and impact of NGOs providing public services to residents.

E: “We took CPC as an example, in its community, our sub-district office feel much easier on social welfare part because CPC is helping us”.

C: “I can see the community be willing to let us take care of the welfare parts because we are doing well so far, the department of civil affairs is satisfied with our work.”

C and E’s words indicate that there is no doubt that NGOs like CPC are an important factor in alleviating government burden in regard to social welfare. NGOs assist the government to improve its ability to provide public services to residents. Consequently, we can see that the government is willing to continue its financial
support to NGOs like CPC which in turn creates a space for NGOs development in China.

Interviewee F referred to his own study on top-down NGOs in China and his reflections when working with CPC:

“I have studied several NGOs in China, but I have only found find few organizations in Beijing and Shanghai that have better economic conditions compared to top-down NGOs such as CPC”

F makes it clear that top-down NGOs appear to have good economic conditions in China since they benefit of government’s financial support for their operations. Due to the fact that different regions have different economic conditions, NGOs development in different parts of the country is lopsided.

Professor Wang (2010) who is the director of the institute of NGO research in Tsinghua University did a research, he mentioned that there are more than 3,000,000 NGOs in China, but are only 400,000 NGOs have been registered in Civil Affair Bureau. But the only way for NGO to obtain the lawful status is registration. Why cannot those NGOs obtain legal protection? In other words, what kind of approval process led to the failure of an NGO to be registered?

B: All the NGOs, not only CPC should be registered at Civil Affair Bureau in order to get permission from the government. It will not only help government to manage, but also promote all these NGOs to normalize their services. Before registration, CPC should have good service conception and in which way it wants to provide the services and to put on records in Sub-District office. /.../ Government empowered Sub-District office to supervise and examine our work.

What B said is in accordance with the provision of Regulation on Registration and Administration of Social Organization and Provisional Regulations for the Registration Administration of People-Run Non-Enterprise Units. This requires NGOs in China to adhere to the system of dual administration. That means CPC not only have to accept the management from Sub-District office, but also obey the management from Civil Affair Bureau.

The approval process is more complicated. As B said, before registration CPC should get the approval documents from Sub-District office. But what kinds of
department can sign the approval documents to NGOs? Regulation on Registration and Administration of Social Organization and Provisional Regulations for the Registration Administration of People-Run Non-Enterprise Units said:

*It should be the department concerned of the State Council or the department approved by local people's governments at or above the county level*

Since the CPC is an experimental program, it is not difficult for them to obtain the approval documents. But for other NGOs it can be quite difficult. So most of small NGOs give up registration, which also means they give up their rights and interests which they supposed to have.

**9.3.2 Difficulties**

In this section, the authors choose to not merely analyze the data they gathered through the interviews, but also to use the literature on the Chinese regulations that are related to NGOs development. According to ecological system perspective, macro level is about giving a framework to the individual, Chinese regulations are in this regard the legal framework that China provides to NGOs working with social welfare.

**Difficulties in analyzing interview data**

From the macro-framework level, the authors focus on how China’s social environment gives the framework to NGOs like CPC. The interviews gave only limited information about difficulties at macro level. The following is an example out of institutional perspective:

*D: “I think the problem for NGOs in China is that there is a specific legal system to support or guide them to work, it means that NGOs are depending on how local government thinks. If local government is willing to develop them, then NGOs have space to develop.”*

Similarly, interviewee A refers to “if we have an idea, we need to talk to Civil Affairs Bureau, if the leader of the Bureau is convinced that it will work, he will approve us to do so, if he think is not working, we cannot do anything.”
Both A’s and D’s answers indicate that how well the NGOs develop is dependent on and proportional to the decisions of the local governments. Given this situation, our conclusion is that there a lack of laws and regulations for protecting and supporting NGOs development in China today. Interviewee F pointed out an additional difficulty emerging from the part of the society.

F: “I can take CPC as an example; it only can provide social welfare services in its own community. Our society is not only need provides social services, but also in different aspects like empower people, change the economic status and so on. What we can do now is very limited.”

What F mentioned is similar to what B mentioned in micro level, about the limited scale of services for CPC. Small scale of services provides and only provides social services to the community can refer that services NGOs provide can’t meet the demand of society yet. One is because they don’t have enough funds to provide more services; another reason is traditionally, those services should provides by government, this change may not be familiar to residents and government officer may not know how to help NGOs working with this in a correct way.

Chinese regulations limited NGOs’ development

The reason we put this section in the results and analysis part is this is the outcomes from our literature study, to show the limitation that Chinese regulations give to NGO’s development. For the NGO’s development in China, government financial support cannot be the only source of funds. Social donations should play a much more important role. But why don’t NGOs like CPC have donations from other areas? The authors raise this question after the interview can consider taxes as a potential source of the problem. In order to confirm our suspicions, we check the legal documents pertaining to donation taxes which can be use in our study. Welfare Donations Law of the People’s Republic of China had been promulgated In June of 1999. This law stipulated preferential measures about the tax for the society donations.

Article 26: According to the stipulations of relevant laws and administrative regulations, import tariffs and the value-added tax imposed on import links will be reduced or exempted for goods donated by the donor from outside the country to social bodies engaged in public welfare and non-profit welfare administration units for the use of public welfare undertakings.
Article 27: Local people's governments should extend support and preferential treatment to the public welfare projects donated to localities under their jurisdiction.

As we can see in these articles, they are principled and simple, and lack of operability. In article 26, for the words about ‘reduced’ and ‘exempted’ are not quite clear. And in this Welfare Donation Law, there is not any article to explain that in which situation import tariffs and the value-added tax can be reduced, and how many percent the tax can be reduced. This type of uncertainty will not encourage private donations and may lead to unjust and unequal treatment. When we asked interviewees about if they have any ideas of article 26 and 27 or some relative laws, they can say nothing about it. So the problem is if people even the chief of CPC do not know it, how can other social workers who work in NGO know how to use it?

Rules and regulations are the most effective method and important way for organization to protect its rights and interests. We asked interviewees about are they familiar with these rules and regulations. They answered:

B: There are some rules and regulations we should follow. But for now.... for CPC... You can search the internet about the rules and regulation for NGOs.

It is obvious that B is unfamiliar with these rules and regulations. They did not have any awareness about how to protect its rights and interests. But after conducting a literature study, the authors find that China does in fact have rules and regulations about Chinese Non-government organizations. They are:

Constitution of the People’s Republic of China:
Article 35 Citizens of the People's Republic of China enjoy freedom of speech, of the press, of assembly, of association, of procession and of demonstration.

General Principles of the Civil Law of the People’s Republic of China:
Article 50 an independently funded official organ shall be qualified as a legal person on the day it is established. If according to law an institution or social organization having the qualifications of a legal person needs not go through the procedures for registering as a legal person, it shall be qualified as a legal person on the day it is established; if according to law it does need to go
through the registration procedures, it shall be qualified as a legal person after being approved and registered.

As the most highest and general basic law in China, the constitution of the People’s Republic of China only prescribe that citizens have the rights of association. And also for the General Principles of the Civil Law, it only prescribe the legal person has the civil legal status. There is nothing more than that. And there are some administrative rules and regulations, such as Regulation on Registration and Administration of Social Organization, Provisional Regulations for the Registration Administration of People-Run Non-Enterprise Units and Regulation on the Administration of Foundation. There is not any law or regulation really established for Non-government organization. The jurisprudence of NGO is faultiness, and it lack of overall plan. There are some local rules and regulations to require NGOs’ work. But it is limited by the low-level legislation and narrow applicable range. So it is hard to administrate in the common range.

9.4 How are NGOs defined in China?

Salamon & Anheier (1999) refers to five characteristics that define NGOs: formal, non-governmental, non-profit, self-governing and voluntary. If take CPC as an example for China's NGO, it is a formal organization which is registered; the objective of CPC is to provide free or low-paid services to residents in its community, so we can see CPC fits the characteristics of formal and voluntary.

CPC is a typical top-down NGO – the government empowers it to provide services to residents who live in its community. It have own administration, financial system and employees, this is the part which CPC claims it is independent from government. But in order to get government support, CPC have to accomplished some tasks from government, this means it will lose a part of self-governing, arrange activities according to government's plan.

Li (2005) points out there's two factors to defined non-profit, one is the purpose of the organization is not for profit, the other is the surpluses should be use for public welfare, shouldn't distribute to the member of the organization. The services CPC provides to residents is free or low-paid, this shows that the purpose of CPC's establish is not for profit. But during the interview, B said:

The distribute process is that we should deduct our employees' salary, office equipment wastage and budget of activities such as the payment of teachers
and doctors. If there is some money left, it will become the bonus wage for the employees.

In conclusion, we can defined NGOs in China as formal voluntary organizations whose purpose is not for profit, independent from government systems, and a part of self-governing.

Top-down NGOs have a lot of connections with government like financial support and government requirements as we mentioned earlier. Some people call this type of top-down NGO as GONGO (government organized NGO), which indicates that people didn't define organization like CPC as NGOs - they saw this kind of organization as a part of the government trying to adapt to the social environment. Top-down NGOs get government support in different way, but bottom-up NGOs are limited by themselves and social system, they can't get legal recognition for the country and don't have enough space to develop.
10. Discussion

The objective of this study is to obtain new development models of NGOs working with social welfare under China’s social situation. The authors accomplish this through analyzing NGOs’ characteristics, difficulties, and possibilities. In this chapter the authors will give a brief summary of the results, and a discussion about theory and methodology. The authors also compare NGOs in China to western NGOs and how this research is connected to social welfare.

10.1 Brief summary of the results

In this research, the authors try to analyze the empirical data and literature study in micro, meso and macro levels in order to get a comprehensive view of how NGOs work with social welfare in China. The answer to the research question in this thesis about the characteristics, difficulties and possibilities for NGOs working with social welfare in China is:

The characteristics that can be concluded from this analysis are NGOs like CPC are established as an experimental programme in a particular situation in China. This kind of NGOs’ handle ability and easiness to control has resulted in the Chinese government’s willingness to develop them; CPC is a supplementary form for Sub-District office to provide social welfare services; its scale of services is small and scope of activities is limited; government financial support is the only source of CPC and NGO like CPC did not have regulation to ensure their regular operation; it promotes the quality of public services and improves the function of community services; and it provides a continuous interactive cooperation process between the state and citizens, government organization and NGO, public institution and private institution; in the community development, CPC became a part of management force in the community to dissolve some conflicts and contradictions. These kinds of NGOs help the government to improve its ability to provide public services to the residents. Also, NGO like CPC need get registration in Civil Affair Bureau through complicated process to get legal protection.

One of the possibilities for an NGO working with social welfare in China is that the NGO gradually becomes a bridge between government and residents. Through community construction it can be transformed into a complementary tool of government management. There are two directions for the development of top-down
NGOs - one is to become an organization attached to the government, and the other is to become more autonomous.

The difficulties for CPC is it lack of thorough finance system; lack of professional social work and knowledge and social worker are not familiar with the rules or regulations which are related to their work; there’s no specific law to protect or support this kind of NGOs development and that the services that NGOs provide are limited and cannot meet the demands of the society yet. The development of top-down NGO is still decided by government policy, and the general characteristics of NGOs are a lack of solid management and an overall plan.

10.2 Theory discussion

The authors use system theory and ecological perspective in this study. Systems theory provides a way to understand how different elements can influence the whole organization (Payne, 2005); Bronfenbrenner’s Ecological Model of Human Development tries to examine how different elements affect each other in a social environment. The core of the ecological perspective is the connection of continuous interaction between the individuals and their environment (Sand, 2001). NGOs situation in China is settled, it is important to know how to maximize efficiencies of NGOs in community. The social circumstance provides a framework to NGOs and it is important to consider these when analyzing the working model of NGOs in China.

These theories and analytical model provide a systematic way to analyze NGOs’ current situation in China, and try to include all aspects of influence.

We took CPC as an example, at the macro level, one of the limitations is the jurisprudence of NGO is faultiness, NGOs need to obey the management of the Sub-District office and the Civil Affair Bureau. This gives the framework for NGOs in China. At the meso level, the focus is on the interaction between micro and macro, which means that the community which the NGO belongs to is influenced by the NGO itself and also confined by the national framework. So providing service in the community becomes a medium for NGOs to link the national framework, community residents, other organizations, and NGOs themselves. But the crucial factor is how much space the Chinese government leaves to the community for the development of NGOs. Without enough space, a large percent of NGOs will transform into a governmental organization. At the Micro level, the authors observe that CPC need to obey the management of Sub-District office since it needs the help of the office to provide social welfare services. So CPC became a supplementary
form for the Sub-District office. And in order to meet the community’s needs, CPC provides services to residents and gradually becomes a bridge between government and residents. We can see each level is nested with the others, and affects each other.

10.3 Methodology discussion

The qualitative method has been used in this research including semi-structured interviews and a literature study. Because the object of this research is NGOs in China, but the authors are in Sweden, the telephone interview was conducted via Skype. One of the limitations of this study was location since the authors couldn’t go to CPC while doing this research, and the numbers of interviews was limited. We’ve done three interviews in total, but two of them are the same person, so actually we only interview two persons. Interview B is a social worker at CPC. During that interview, B introduced a lot of information about CPC’s working environment and their activities, so most of her interview data has been used in the background of CPC. The empirical data is not enough and in order to make up for that, the authors try to use as much detail in the quotations for analysis as possible. Additionally, the literature study was considered as a supplementary data to support our finds.

10.4 Comparisons to western countries

The western concept of an NGO was introduced to China in recent years. Considering earlier research and our results, we find that there are significant between NGOs in China and the west.

10.4.1 Developmental level

In western countries, NGOs have already achieved a high level of development. Government policies create favorable policies for NGOs and the registration processes for NGOs in most western countries is simple. This allows NGOs to develop and become sufficiently large. Chinese NGOs have developed rapidly in recent years but remain in the development stage.

10.4.2 Financial source

From a financial perspective, enterprises and individuals tend to be willing to donate more to NGOs in western countries. In contrast to western countries, most Chinese NGOs are top-down and the only financial source is the government. In this
sense they are limited because of the reliance on government support.

10.4.3 Social impact

Compare with the impact of the society, western country's NGO carried out extensive activities in different aspects such as health services, education, help the poor and so on. Those activities had great positive influences in society and attracted people who had the same values to join in. In China, NGO like CPC already get some achievement in the community, but because NGO is in developing stage, people don't have much understanding about it and the activities its arranged is limited.

10.5 Connect to social welfare

Here we try to discuss one main question to see how NGOs connects to social work: Are NGOs the key factor to promoting the development of social welfare in China?

First we want to answer this question from the role of NGOs:(1) Providing welfare services, (2) Undertaking governments’ welfare services projects, (3) Exploring welfare resources, (4) Providing consultation to government in the policy-making process, and (5) Pioneering new services, and advocating human rights, social justice and equality. (Ngai, 2006) It is obvious that NGOs are an important institution for providing and delivering social welfare. But how will this arrive in China? From the results and analysis part of this thesis, the possibilities part had not been mentioned in the macro level. From the characteristics and difficulties part, it is hard to say that Chinese society (or Chinese government) leave enough space for the development of NGO. For instance, the dual administration system makes the approval process more complicated; the laws and regulations are not clear or well specified. These conditions lead NGOs to a poor return on their investments in society because they are not approved by law. Even some of the NGOs have good effect in the community which they belong to, it might still have some internal problems. All of this should be convincing enough that NGOs do play an active role in social welfare but the Chinese government maintains an attitude that continues to limit the development of NGOs. So in a sense, China’s social welfare remains on a level where it relies on the government. If the Chinese government gives NGOs more support and forms more partnership, the social welfare system could grow faster.
10.6 Further study

In the further study, we consider to focus on NGOs economic autonomy. According to our results, we can see that NGOs in China’s autonomy was limited by its economic conditions; this situation lets it need to follow more government requirement. In other word, even NGOs still under China’s political framework, but if they have multiple financial sources, they will get more autonomy in their work. The multiple financial sources could contain service fee, donation or company support, etc. One of the characteristics of NGOs is non-profit, but it doesn’t mean that they can’t charge any service fee to support their own functioning and development, so how to charge the fee appropriately and use money effectively can be discuss in the future.
11. REFERENCES


**Legal documents:**
- All-China Women's Federation Regulation
- Welfare Donations Law of the People’s Republic of China
- Constitution of the People’s Republic of China
- General Principles of the Civil Law of the People’s Republic of China
- Regulation on Registration and Administration of Social Organization
- Provisional Regulations for the Registration Administration of People-Run Non-Enterprise Units
- Regulation on the Administration of Foundation.
12. Appendix 1 - Interview Guide 1

1. What are the goals of CPC, its function and methods of work?
2. How do you communicate with government?
3. What the work task the government gives to you?
4. What is the possibilities and limitation to this NGO?
5. How does the government give you support?
13. Appendix 2 - Interview Guide 2

1. How do you think top-down NGOs like Community Public Centre CPC?
2. Does (CPC) need to register in order to get the permission by local or national government? In which way to registered?
3. Does CPC should obey some of the local or national rules and regulations?
4. Is there any preferential policy for CPC from the local or national government?
5. Does CPC cooperate with other NGOs, government department, private sector or service agency? In which way to cooperated?
6. Does CPC get any achievement?
7. Is there any attitude change of the media since CPC was established until now on when they report it?
8. What is CPC’s economic source?
9. For the government finance support, does CPC need to sign the contract with government?
10. Does the government survey the disbursement of CPC?
11. How does CPC itself control the budgeting?
12. Is there any other economic source, like social donation? If there is, does CPC need to pay the tax about this part?
13. How do NGOs cooperate with government?